

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: June 27, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:40 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: John Klingman

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the May 23, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Robbie Cangelosi

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 501 Elysian Fields

Application: Francisco Alecha, applicant; 501 Efa Hotel LLC, owner; Partial demolition of two (2) existing warehouses and new construction of 75,000 SF four-story hotel [DETAIL REVIEW ONLY].

Speakers: Allen Johnson spoke regarding his opposition to the demolition and construction.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that proposed elevation labeled 'R2' is the best option moving forward but stated it is reading as a flat box with balconies and requires more articulation. The ARC suggested incorporating plane changes at the intersection of the brick and stucco surfaces. They recommended projecting the stucco plane 8"-12" over of the brick plinth at the first level. At the pedestrian level, the ARC recommended raising the height(s) of the vehicular and ventilation openings at Decatur and Marigny Street. This modification may be accomplished using recesses as opposed to increasing the openings. The ARC agreed the pedestrian level of the Marigny Street elevation appears unfriendly and suggested incorporating a screening material, i.e. greenscreen system, at the ventilation opening. They also recommended removing the header at the loading entry and extending the opening up to the underside of the stucco projection. The ARC recommended changing the window type at the two-story brick element at the right side of the Decatur Street elevation and removing the opening at the circulation corridor per the proposed plans. They suggested incorporating a window type that relates more to the adjacent warehouse context.

In regards to the balconies, the ARC agreed the balconies should be addressed as opportunities of design rather than collections of elements. The divided door lites and fixed single hung window with a lower sash is an odd configuration and the heavy top rail of the balcony railing is not successful. They suggested modifying the windows to show a fixed casement with a hopper below as an alternative.

The ARC agreed the entry proposal remains underwhelming. They agreed the removal of the balconies above the entry is an improvement but further investigation and articulation is required.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2270 St Claude Ave.

Application: Loretta Katherine Harmon, applicant; 1024 Mandeville LLC, owner; Renovation of existing two-story vacant commercial building to mixed-use development to include new gallery and the restoration of existing Victorian shotgun.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended incorporating a break between the existing raised Victorian shotgun and the renovated warehouse to delineate the mixed-use structure from the historic structure. The pedestrian elevation of the raised shotgun should better reflect the aesthetic of similarly raised shotguns along St Claude Avenue. At the renovated warehouse, the ARC recommended revising the French doors to be either traditional or contemporary, as opposed to an amalgam of both. They also recommended confirming the integration of the gallery columns with subsurface elements. The ARC stated irregularly spaced gallery columns is not an approvable condition. The ARC recommended shifting the garage opening at the Mandeville Street elevation to the left and extending the edge of that façade element to the ground. They also recommended shifting the steps back at the St. Claude Ave elevations to align with the front plane of the building. Additionally, they stated that should gates be incorporated at the street-facing elevations, an elevation of that condition would require additional review and approval at the Staff level. The ARC made note of the potential maintenance issue of the proposed canvas awnings and stated that metal awnings would also be approvable should the applicant decide to change the material.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1476 Magazine St.

Application: Jonathan Tate, applicant; Magazine Race, LLC, owner; ARC review of details for previously approved, new construction of 7,900 SF, three-story, mixed use building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the use of artisan hardi would be appropriate, but the transition from the front and the back of the building needed further clarification. The portion of the building at the rear should be uniform to highlight the corbelling detail of the masonry structure. The head heights of the windows at the back portion should be raised to match those at the masonry wall. The windows should be regularly spaced along the Race Street elevation. The brick at the rear of the three story building should be pulled over to meet the trellis.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1012 Brooklyn Ave.
Application: Robert Boyd, applicant; St. Michael Special School For, owner; Restore circa 1850's Convent building, and construct new chapel addition at the rear.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of option two, with the final details to be worked out at the staff level.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In Favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
6. 2322 St Thomas St.
Application: Robert Bandzuch, applicant/owner; New construction of a two-story, two-family residential building.
Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer this application for additional review. As proposed the building does not have a contextual relationship with the block and is out of scale. The ARC agreed that the applicant should restudy the massing to better integrate the front portion to the rear and make it more cohesive.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed:
Comments:
7. 930 Louisa.
Application: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Frankenheimer Credit Shelter Trust, owner; Structural renovation of existing single-family residence and existing accessory structure, including new dormers and balcony.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level The ARC agreed that the dormer as presented is too large in scale and is set too close to the existing cross gable. They suggested eliminating the portion of the dormer at the study to reduce the size of the dormer and minimize its visibility. The spring point of the dormer should be set below the existing roof ridge. Additionally, the rear balcony depth should be reduced to a maximum of 4'-0".
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:
8. 4510 St Claude Ave.
Application: Katawan Fletcher, applicant/owner; Renovate one-story residential building and construct new camelback addition at rear.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposal in general was appropriate, but felt that the presented drawings are inaccurate.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:

9. 313 Morgan St.
Application: Troy Verrett, applicant; Beverly E Duncan, owner; Construction of two-story rear addition, new balcony at front facade, and detached accessory structure.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the gallery reconstruction and rear addition with final details to be worked out at the staff level. It was determined that the accessory structure would not be visible from the public right-of-way. The ARC requested that a copy of the historic photograph of the original gallery be provided to the staff along with the final drawings for review.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:
10. 2719 Decatur St.
Application: Megan Bell, applicant; Home Kendra D, Home Kendra D, owner; New construction of a three-story single-family residential building.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval. The ARC agreed that shifting the three-story building forward in the site overwhelms the existing one-story residential streetscape. The ARC agreed that if the proposal is shifted forward, it should be shifted up to the streetscape and modified to be a more contextually appropriate building. The ARC suggested meeting with the Zoning Administrator to confirm the site requirements and pursuing a possible variance from the Board of Zoning Adjustments (BZA) to shift the proposal back to its original conceptually approved location.
Second: Elliott Perkins
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
11. 907 Lizardi St
Application: Ahmad Larkins, applicant; Demond Cage, owner; Renovation to existing single-family residence and 1200 SF addition.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:
12. 1118 Congress St
Application: Charles Berg, applicant; Ndh Properties, LLC, owner; Renovation of and addition to existing one-story residential building.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with final details to be worked out at the staff level. The existing front door and stoop should remain in place.
Result: Passed
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins
Opposed:
Comments:

13. 1013 Ninth St.

Application: James Brown, applicant; Leola Christy, owner; Demolition of one story residential building and new construction of two-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The ARC agreed that the building details should be more appropriate for the style or they should be simplified. The floor to ceiling heights should be raised, the roof pitch should be a minimum of 7/12, and the dormer should be removed. The building should be brought up to the edge of the street as the zoning allows and the driveway should allow for 18' past the front wall of the building. The overhangs should be restudied to match the style of the building.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 721 Tricou St.

Comments: Item was deferred to the end of the agenda.

15. 1244 Constance St.

Application: Enrique McDonald, applicant; 1200 Constance St Corporation Inc, owner; Renovation and rear addition of two-story, residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The existing conditions are not drawn accurately making it difficult to review the roof changes.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 2936 Esplanade St.

Application: Rama P Bhattacharya, applicant; Soc For Krishna Consciousness I Intern'l, owner; Install patio carport cover accessory structure at existing temple.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review.

The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Meet with Elliott Perkins and Alex Nassar of the HDLC to discuss siting the proposed accessory structure and clarifying the existing condition.
- Integrate the program of the current storage structure into the design of the proposed accessory structure.
- Verify that the proposed accessory structure meets the requirements of the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 2831 St Claude Ave.

Application: Christopher Reade, applicant; Preservation Alliance Of N O Inc, owner; Construct new gallery on front and side elevations of existing two-story commercial building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application to the next ARC meeting. The ARC agreed that the canopy option is more appropriate in scale than the gallery proposal. They agreed that two (2) separate canopies would be more successful in providing coverage and integrating this commercial building with the adjacent structures. They recommended that one canopy should be located at the front elevation and extend around the Press Street elevation to approximately the first telephone pole, and a second canopy should be added at the Press Street elevation at the proposed office entry at the rear right side elevation. They recommended that additional windows (as opposed to doors) would be appropriate at the 2nd level of the Press Street elevation and at the modified door opening at the right side of the front elevation at the ground level. The ARC also recommended that the ramp at the St Claude elevation should be retained and the drawings should be revised to more accurately reflect the existing conditions.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 616 Lizardi St.

Application: Peter Waring, applicant; Gene W Benda, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residence.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Revise plan to allow for 18'-0" minimum distance between front wall of house and nosing of first stair tread to allow for adequate parking space.
- Add steps at front porch signifying and entry door.
- Roof pitch should be increased to a 7:12 pitch.
- Remove or reduce overhangs from 1'-0" to 0'-3".

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 2123 Constance St.

Application: Seth Hawley, applicant; Mario E Venegas, owner; New construction of two-story, residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the height of the second floor porch is out of proportion, so the box beam should be reduced in size or the structure reconfigured to add some height. The columns are too narrow and the entablature is too large for the proposed structure. The building should be brought up to the street, as per zoning, to be more in line with the other buildings on the block. The door at the second floor porch should be restudied.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

21. 5317 Royal St.

Application: Andrew Stephens, applicant; Dianne W Adams, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family residential building on two(2) vacant lots.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- Columns width should increase.
- Windows on façade should increase in height so that the wall space above the windows is reduced.
- Correct the proportions of the entry door with side lites and transom to be more historically appropriate.
- Reduce the spacing between the dormers and center on the appropriate bay.
- Redesign the dormers to remove the wall return between the window framing and sidewalls.
- The ARC agreed and noted several errors and deficiencies on the drawings and requested that they be corrected, developed, and thoroughly detailed.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

22. 1838 S Carrolton Ave.

Application: Charles G III Kunz, applicant/owner; Construct 600 SF accessory structure.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended confirming the proposed accessory structure complies with the City of New Orleans Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance. Following confirmation and any required site modifications, the ARC recommended changing the weatherboards over the garage door to a smooth surface material, and to lower and change the gable window to a rectangular opening. Additionally, the ARC stated the adjacent fence appears to have been altered in the last year and requires modification to bring it into compliance with the zoning ordinance.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

21. 721 Tricou St.

Application: Ducar Real Estate Investments LLC, applicant/owner; New Construction of single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Robbie Cangelosi, Cynthia Dubberley, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.